NATIONAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND LABOUR COUNCIL

NEDLAC REPORT ON THE

CRITICAL SKILLS LIST TABLED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF HOME AFFAIRS

1.   BACKGROUND

1.1.   In February 2021, the Minister of Home Affairs published the *draft* Critical Skills List (CSL) for public comment. The public was given thirty (30) days to submit comments to Government on the CSL.

1.2.   The Department of Home Affairs (DHA) defines critical skills as:
"*Skills that are regarded, through labour market availability and analysis, to be critical for improvement in economic growth and without which certain projects and work could not be undertaken, as well as high-level skills that will enhance the skills pool in the economy which in turn will encourage and potentially accelerate growth in the economy (DHA, 2019).*

1.3.   Nedlac social partners identified a need to engage on the Critical Skills List which aimed to support the economic growth in line with the Economic Reconstruction and Restructuring Plan (ERRP), and promoting the realisation of the goals set out in the National Development Plan. Social partners therefore requested Government to table the Critical Skills List at Nedlac.

1.4.   In preparation for the engagement process, in March 2021, the Labour Market Chamber (LMC) and Development Chamber (DC) Convenors established a joint six-a-side task team to engage on the Critical Skills List. The terms of reference for this process were also developed.

1.5.   On 23 March 2021, Nedlac wrote to Government reminding it to table the revised CSL which incorporated public comments, at Nedlac for engagement by social partners.

1.6.   Government (DHA) responded to Nedlac on 29 April 2021 and stated that the Critical Skills List needed to undergo a quality assurance process. This process sought to ensure that the inclusion and exclusion of occupations on the CSL was informed by a sound methodology, thorough research and a broad public participation.

1.7. On 04 August 2021, Government confirmed that it was ready to table the revised Critical Skills however, it subsequently requested to be granted more time to revisit its internal processes to finalise the CSL and obtain approval from all relevant Ministers for the CSL to be tabled at Nedlac. These included the Ministers of Higher Education and Training, Home Affairs, Employment and Labour and Trade and Industry and Competition.

1.8. Government thereafter presented the CSL at a Nedlac Labour and Development Dialogue Session convened on 03 September 2021. A report arising from the dialogue session was distributed to all delegates following the convening of the dialogue session.

1.9. At the session, the social partners confirmed the establishment of the Joint Nedlac Critical Skills Task Team, in line with the decision of the DC and LMC Convenors as indicated above.

2. PURPOSE FOR CONVENING THE TASK TEAM ON CRITICAL SKILLS LIST

2.1. The task team was established to:

2.1.1. Engage on the CSL incorporating the public comment, and ascertain that the skills contained in the CSL are in line with those needed by the economy and are critical for economic growth.

2.1.2. Develop a Nedlac Report, which would outline the areas of agreement, areas of disagreement, and recommendations arising from the engagements.

3. OBJECTIVES OF THE CRITICAL SKILLS LIST

3.1. The CSL seeks to identify skills that are regarded as critical for improvement on economic growth and considered to be in acute shortage or likely to be in the future, due to the importance of such skill for South African strategic priorities.

3.2. The CSL, 2020 was therefore developed in line with the Immigration Act, to contribute towards the realisation of the ERRP and the NDP.

3.3. In recognition of critical skills shortage in South Africa and the inability of the education and training system to meet the growing demands of the labour market in the short-term, the Immigration Act, No. 13 of 2002 provides for government to pursue several objectives and regulate the intake of skilled foreigners in order to promote economic growth.

3.4. The Immigration Act, 2002 (Act No. 13 of 2002) ("the Immigration Act") states that " in providing for the regulation of admission of foreigners to, their residence in, and their departure from the Republic and for matters connected therewith, the Department of Home Affairs must ensure that the South African economy has access at all times to the full measure of needed contributions by foreigners and that the contribution of foreigners in the South African labour market does not adversely impact on existing labour standards and the rights and expectations of South African workers".

4. PROCESS AT NEDLAC

4.1. The CSL was formally tabled on 17 September 2021 at the Critical Skills List Task Team for engagement by social partners. Government indicated that the CSL was informed by the research it had conducted through the Labour Market Intelligence (LMI) research programme and through consulting the affected or relevant institutions.

4.2. At the meeting held on 25 October 2021, Government stated that it was updating the CSL parallel to the Nedlac process, considering the inputs that were made by social partners. It was therefore agreed that the updated, also referred to as "live" list, would be submitted to social partners for final inputs.

4.3. The list was subsequently submitted by Government to the one-a-side task team on 09 November 2021.

4.4. Business tabled its objections on the approach followed by Government of updating the CSL parallel to the Nedlac process. It stated that the Nedlac Report records areas of Agreement and Disagreement on the original document submitted to Nedlac for engagement, so that the interested parties can track the amendments made. These amendments that were made to the list during engagements should therefore be noted as such to reflect the departure points.

4.5. It was thereafter agreed that the normal Nedlac process would be followed, where a Nedlac Report would stipulate areas of Agreement and Disagreement on the original CSL document tabled by Government.

4.6. Furthermore, Business objected to the approach taken by constituencies to reject and remove occupations from the list, without providing any evidence-based rationale, whereas, the Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) had substantiated its rationale through the Labour Market Intelligence research programme, as well as the criteria it presented to the constituencies in the first meeting.

4.7. The Task Team met on the following dates:

4.7.1.	17 September 2021	4.7.4.	25 October 2021
4.7.2.	29 September 2021	4.7.5.	09 November 2021
4.7.3.	08 October 2021	4.7.6.	29 November 2021

4.8. The following documents were submitted to the task team:

Annexure 1	Revised Critical Skills list incorporating public comment
Annexure 2	Nedlac Report arising from the dialogue session held on 03 September 2021

Annexure 3	Presentation on the Methodology informing the inclusion of the occupations on the List
Annexure 4	Technical report for the 2020 Critical Skills List

5. AREAS OF AGREEMENT

5.1. Social partners agreed on the following:

5.1.1. Hand Shearer – OFO Code 116273 & Machine Shearer – OFO Code 116277

(a) Business initially proposed that these occupations should be included in the CSL. However, following a bilateral between Government and Business, it was agreed that Business would revoke its proposal to add these occupations on the CSL, on condition that the short-term needs would be addressed through the corporate permit system. Furthermore, it was agreed that a separate process would be followed to arrive at a long-term solution to close the gap between the number of qualified and experienced shearers and the demand in the economy.

5.1.2. No. 5 - Customer Service Manager (Master's Degree (NQF Level 9)

(a) The inclusion of this occupation was supported by Business into the CSL. This occupation was under the Business Process Outsourcing (BPO) which presented shortage of this occupation in this regard.

(b) Labour and Community did not agree with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL, and stated that there were graduates that could be trained to occupy this occupation.

(c) Government stated that it would exclude this on the CSL as a critical skill, however it would be included to be specific to the BPO sector.

(d) It was therefore agreed that this occupation would not be included as part of the CSL, but be specific to the BPO.

5.1.3. No. 72 - University Lecturer Professional (Doctoral Qualification NQF Level 9)

(a) Business disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL and stated that the list should be limited to specialisation and skills in short supply. It noted that the list included subject areas such as South African languages and South African law. This occupation, University Lecturer was broad and should be structured into sub-categories at appropriate NQF level. It proposed that the NQF level could be set at NQF level 8 for some categories of lecturers to attract local talent.

(b) Community and Labour agreed with Business and stated that local lecturers should be trained to occupy this occupation.

5.2. Constituencies agreed on the inclusion of the following list of occupations, and that they should be incorporated onto the final Critical Skills List:

5.2.1. **No.1 - Director (Enterprise /Organisation) (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**
5.2.1.1. **Chief Executive Office**
5.2.1.2. **Managing Director**

(a) Constituencies agreed on the inclusion of the above occupations into the CSL, with the understanding that Government would update the requirement from NQF 9 to NQF 8 and that the National Career Advice Portal (NCAP) suggested a Master's in Business Administration (MBA) qualification for this occupation which is at NQF 8.

5.2.2. **No.3 - Corporate General Manager (medium enterprises or larger) (Master of Business Administration NQF 8)**

(a) It was agreed that this should be included in the CSL, with the proviso that graduates in this qualification would be provided with an opportunity to gain experience in this regard and the enhancement of skills development was key.

5.2.3. **No.4 - Programme or Project Manager (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**

(a) It was agreed that this occupation should be included into the CSL and also Managers, Scientists, Researchers, were required to have an NQF 9, Engineers and Finance occupations were required to have NQF 8. ICT practitioners to have NQF 7 and Technicians and Technologists, NQF 6.

5.2.4. **No.6 - Quality Systems Manager (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**
5.2.1.3. **Quality Control Manager**
5.2.1.4. **Quality Assurance Systems Auditor**

(a) It was agreed that this should be included in the CSL and that training in line with digital transformation was needed.

5.2.5. **No. 90 Data Scientist (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**

(a) It was agreed that this occupation should be included in the CSL and also Managers, Scientists, Researchers, were required to have an NQF 9. Engineers and Finance occupations were required to have NQF 8. ICT practitioners to have NQF 7 and Technicians and Technologists, NQF 6.

5.3. The following list of occupations and qualifications were agreed without any amendments:

5.3.1. **No. 20 Physicist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)
(a) Astrophysicist
(b) Atmospheric physicist
5.3.2. **No. 21 Climate Change Scientist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)
5.3.3. **No. 22 Chemist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)
(a) Analytical Chemist

(b) Manufacturing Chemist
(c) Biochemist
(d) Geochemist
(e) Chemical Scientist
(f) Chemist Specialist (Personal Care Industry), and;
(g) Industrial Chemist

5.3.4. **No.23 Geologist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.5. **No. 24 Geophysicist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9

5.3.6. **No. 25 Materials Scientist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.7. **No. 26 Mineralogist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.8. **No.27 Hydrologist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.9. **No. 28 Oceanographer** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.10. **No. 29 Actuary** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate
(a) Food and Beverage Scientist

5.3.11. **No. 30 General Biologist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)
(a) Biological Scientist

5.3.12. **No. 31 Biotechnologist** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma NQF6)
(a) Bioinformation
(b) Bioinformatacist
(c) Molecular Geneticist

5.3.13. **No. 32 Microbiologist** (Master's Degree NQF 9)
(a) **Virologist**
(b) **Molecular biologist**
(c) **Microbiological scientist**

5.3.14. **No. 33 Zoologist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)
(a) Animal Scientist

5.3.15. **No. 34 Agricultural Scientist** (Masters Degree NQF 9)

5.3.16. **No.35 Food and Beverage Scientist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.17. **No.36 Conservation Scientist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.18. **No. 37 Environmental Scientist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.19. **No. 38 Industrial Engineer** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.20. **No. 39 Industrial Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF6)

5.3.21. **No.42 Mechanical Engineer** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.22. **No.43 Mechanical Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.23. **No. 44 Aeronautical Engineer** (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.24. **No. 45 Aeronautical Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.25. **No. 46 Naval Architect** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.26. **No.47 Chemical Engineer** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.27. **No. 48 Chemical Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.28. **No. 49 Mining Engineer** (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.29. **No. 50 Metallurgist** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.30. **No. 51 Biomedical Engineer** (Master's Degree (NQF 9) Clinical Engineer

5.3.31. **No. 52 Quantity Surveyor** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.32. **No. 53 Agricultural Engineer** (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.33. **No. 54 Agricultural Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.34. **No. 55 Electrical Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.35. **No. 56 Energy or Nuclear Energy Engineer** (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.36. **No. 57 Energy Engineering Technologist** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6) - Energy Sustainability Specialist

5.3.37. **No. 58 Electronics Engineer instrumentation engineer** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.38. **No. 59 Architect** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.39. **No. 60 Urban and Regional Planner** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.40. **No. 61 Multimedia Designer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.41. **No. 78 Investment Analyst** (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.42. **No. 79 Investment Advisor** (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.43. **No. 90 Data Scientist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.44. **No. 91 Software Developer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.45. **No. 92 Programmer Analyst** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.46. **No. 93 Developer Programmer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.47. **No. 94 Multimedia Specialist** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.48. **No. 96 Applications Programmer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.49. **No. 97 Computers Quality Assurance Analyst** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.50. **No. 98 Computer Network and Systems Engineer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)
- **(a) Network Engineer**
- **(b) Systems Engineer**
- **(c) Network Programmer**
- **(d) Programme Analyst**
- **(e) Systems Integrator**

5.3.51. **No. 103 Chemistry Technician** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.52. **No.104 Town Planning Technician** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.53. **No. 105 Electronic Engineering Technician** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)
- **(a) Clinical Engineering Technician**
- **(b) Medical Equipment Maintainer**

5.3.54. **No. 106 Mechanical Engineering Technician** Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.55. **No. 112 Inbound Contact Consultant** (with first language speaking and translating capabilities in the following languages: German, Swiss, German, Flemish, Greek, Swedish, Danish, Italian, Dutch, Spanish, Mandarin and French) National Certificate (NQF Level 4)

5.3.56. **No. 113 Outbound Contact Centre Consultant** (with first language speaking and translating capabilities in the following languages: German, Flemish, Greek, Swedish, Danish, Italian, Spanish, Mandarin and French)

5.3.57. **No. 9 Manufacturing Operations Manager** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.58. **No. 10 Engineering Manager** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.59. **No. 11 Supply and Distribution Manager and Supply Chain Manager** (Master's Degree (NQF 8)

5.3.60. **No. 18 Environmental Manager** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma NQF 7)

5.3.61. **No. 40 Civil Engineer** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.62. **No. 75 Tax Professional** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.63. **No. 76 External Auditor (**Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.64. **No.77 Forensic Accountant** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.65. **No. 83 Corporate Treasurer** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

     (a)   Financial Risk Manager

5.3.66. **No. 84 Organisational Risk Manager** (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

5.3.67. **No. 85 Internal Auditor** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.68. **No. 87 Occupational Instructor - Product Trainer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.69. **No. 95 Web Developer** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.70. **No. 99 Network Analyst** (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

5.3.71. **No. 102 Economist – Agricultural Economist, Transport Economist** (Master's Degree (NQF 9)

5.3.72. **No. 110 Draughtsperson** (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)

5.3.73. **No. 117 Glass Maker -Glass Blower** (National Certificate (NQF 4)

5.3.74. **Automation Engineer**

6.   AREAS OF DISAGREEMENTS

6.1.   There was no consensus to include the following list of occupations onto the final Critical Skills List, reasons for the disagreement is outlined under each occupation:

    6.1.1.   **No. 2 Policy and Planning Manager (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**

        (a)   Business' view was that the occupation was previously listed on the original list with requirement of a Diploma or Advanced certificate (NQF Level 6), however on the tabled revised list the requirements have been changed. It was proposed that the requirement of the revised NQF 9 should be changed and consider retaining the original NQF 6 requirement.

        (b)   Labour disagreed with the proposal from Business and stated that the requirement of the NQF Level 6 for a manager was too low for this particular occupation. It added that the country had a number of unemployed graduates who possess this qualification at the level proposed by Government.

        (c)   Community stated that there were excess of individuals in the country who could occupy this position from the social sciences and Development Studies disciplines.

        (d)   Government stated that Managers, Scientists, Researchers, were required to have an NQF 9, Engineers and Finance occupations, NQF 8, ICT, NQF 7 and Technicians and Technologists, NQF 6.

        (e)   Business thereafter accepted and agreed to Government's response in this regard, therefore agreed to the inclusion of this occupation. Nevertheless, this remained an area of disagreement as Labour and Community objected to its inclusion into the CSL.

6.1.2. **No. 7 - Research and Development Manager (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**

(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL, as they indicated that there was a surplus of unemployed graduates with such qualifications. Furthermore, the evidence produced that indicated shortage was not enough to include this occupation into the list.

6.1.3. **No. 8 – Agricultural Farm Manager (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)**

(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion and stated that South Africa had a surplus of unemployed graduates with such qualifications.

6.1.4. **No. 12 Airport or Harbour Manager (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion and stated that South Africa has many professionals and graduates with such qualifications.

6.1.5. **No. 13 Chief Information Officer (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour disagreed with the inclusion and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications.
(c) Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation as it indicated that it was not aligned to the in-demand list of ICT Skills Survey, 2016, that was published by the Wits University's Joburg Centre for Software Engineering and Institute of Information Technology Professionals South Africa.

6.1.6. **No. 14 ICT Project Manager (Master's Degree (NQF Level 9)**

(a) Business and Labour supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) However, Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation for the same reason provided above under Chief Information Officer.

6.1.7. **No. 15 Data Management Manager (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

(a) Business and Community supported the inclusion of the occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour did not support the inclusion of this occupation and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications. These are in many Call Centre operations and are poorly paid.

6.1.8. **No. 16 Information Technology Manager (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**
   (a) Labour and Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
   (b) However, Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation as it indicated that it was not aligned to the in-demand list of ICT Skills Survey, 2016, that was published by the Wits University's Joburg Centre for Software Engineering and Institute of Information Technology Professionals South Africa.
   (c)

6.1.9. **No. 17 Information Systems Director (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**

   (a) Labour and Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
   (b) However, Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation as it indicated that it was not aligned to the in-demand list of ICT Skills Survey, 2016, that was published by the Wits University's Joburg Centre for Software Engineering and Institute of Information Technology Professionals South Africa.
   (c)

6.1.10. **No. 19 - Call or Contact Centre Manager (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**
   (a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation on the list into the CSL. It however stated that an NQF 9 would make this job unattainable for applicants. Therefore, Government needed to review.

   (b) Labour and Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications. This was a growth sector and South Africa had rapidly produced the required skilled professionals to fulfil this need.

6.1.11. **No. 62 - General Medical Practitioner (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF8)**
   (a) Community supported the inclusion of this occupation in the CSL as outlined by Government.
   (b) Labour disagreed and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications. Government should be looking at measures to retain General Practitioners (GP) who are immigrating to better paying jobs overseas.
   (c) Business also disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation on the CSL.

6.1.12. **No. 69 - Hospital Pharmacist (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**
   (a) Business and Community agreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
   (b) Labour stated that South Africa had graduates and experienced pharmacists were being absorbed in the private sector. Therefore, it disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation onto the CSL. It

proposed that Government should work on improving its retention strategy instead of importing these skills.

6.1.13. No. 70 - Industrial Pharmacist (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

(a)   Labour and Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation into the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications.

(b)   Business supported the inclusion of the occupation on the CSL.

(c)   Government indicated that this was a health sector occupation and was part of the issues that were identified for further by the Minister of DHA. It was in the original list due to its importance to the health sector; therefore, it was classified under criteria D2 which relates to strategic priority, due to its Strategic importance. Neither the shortage index, nor the SETA survey indicated shortage. However, this occupation was essential if South Africa was to commence the manufacturing of its own vaccines.

(d)   It was agreed that Department of Home Affairs would make final decision on this occupation.

6.1.14. No. 71 – Retail Pharmacist (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

(a)   Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.

(b)   Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion of the occupation on the CSL and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications.

6.1.15. No. 73 – Further Education and Training (FET) Phase School Teacher (Grades 10-12 Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

(a)   Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL, and stated that unemployed graduates and those who were already trained should be absorbed into this field.

(b)   Business supported the inclusion of Teachers with STEM specialisation on the CSL.

6.1.16. No. 74 - Senior Phase School Teacher (Grades 8 – 9 STEM) (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)

(a)   Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL, and cited the same reason as outlined above on occupation list Number 73 FET Phase School Teacher.

(b)   Business supported the inclusion of the occupation into the list.

6.1.17. No. 81 - Business Development Officer (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)

(a) Business stated that this occupation should be included in the CSL, only with NQF 6 as it originally had an NQF 6 in the original list. It therefore requested that it should be changed back to that level. It noted that the role required a decent formal education background, however, a greater emphasis was placed on acquired experience and networks working across various foreign markets which demonstrated a deep understanding of the markets and opportunities.

(b) Government noted that such occupations sometimes required experience, however a qualification would provide some signal of skill. An honours degree was therefore sufficient in this regard given the requirements in National Career Advice Portal (NCAP) for similar occupations in the business development field.

(c) Labour and Community also disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL and stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications.

6.1.18. **No. 82 - Policy Analyst (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**
(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation in the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation as they indicated that there was no evidence of shortage and there were graduates who could be trained to be able to perform the duties required in this occupation.

6.1.19. **No. 86 -Industrial Relations Advisor (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**
(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL and stated that the aggregated feedback from its sectors recommended for a minimum qualification of Bachelor's Degree or NQF 7, together with clerkship and experience be taken into consideration for eligibility for a Critical Skills Visa (CSV) for this occupational role.

(b) Labour and Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation due to lack of evidence on its shortage in the country. They further stated that the Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration (CCMA) had retrenched numerous part-time Commissioners who could easily fill such positions. Labour Practioners from other countries would not be familiar with South African labour law.

6.1.20. **No. 88 – Market Research Analyst (Master's Degree (NQF 9)**
(a) Labour and Community did not agree on the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.

(b) Business stated that the qualification should be retained at NQF 6 as provided for in the original skills list. It further stated that the research analysts were highly skilled individuals and they demonstrated experience in specific fields of market research and analysis.

6.1.21. **No. 89 ICT Systems Analyst (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)**

(a) Business supported inclusion of this occupation.

(b) Community did not support the inclusion of this occupation as it indicated that it was not aligned to the in-demand list of ICT Skills Survey, 2016, that was published by the Wits University's Joburg Centre for Software Engineering and Institute of Information Technology Professionals South Africa.

(c) Labour also did not support the inclusion of this occupation into the list.

6.1.22. **No.100 ICT Security Specialist (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF 7)**

(a) Labour and Business supported the inclusion of the occupation into the CSL.

(b) Community stated that there was a need for Government to build its own capacity in this area as it was a sensitive occupation.

6.1.23. **No. 101 Information Services Manager (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.

(b) Labour and Community stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals and graduates with such qualifications.

(c) Government stated that NCAP suggested that an NQF 7 was sufficient for such a role.

6.1.24. No consensus was reached on the inclusion of the following occupations:

6.1.24.1. **No. 107 Pressure Equipment Inspector (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)**

6.1.24.2. **No. 108 Aeronautical Engineering Technician (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)**

6.1.24.3. **No. 109 Chemical Engineering Technician (Diploma or Advanced Certificate (NQF 6)**

(a) Business supported the inclusion of the above-mentioned occupations into the CSL.

(b) Labour and Community did not support the inclusion of these occupations as they indicated that there was no evidence that South Africa had a shortage of skills in these areas.

6.1.25. **No. 111 - Traffic Controller (National Certificate (NQF Level 4)**
(a) Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion.
(c) Government stated this was excluded because it did not meet the set criteria.

6.1.26. **No. 113 Outbound Contact Centre Consultant**
(a) Business and Community agreed with the inclusion of all the languages onto the CSL (with first language speaking and translating capabilities in the following languages: German, Flemish, Greek, Swedish, Danish, Italian, Spanish, Mandarin and French, Dutch)

6.1.27. **No.114 Air-conditioning and Refrigeration Mechanic (Intermediate certificate (NQF 3)**
    (a)   Business supported inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
    (b)   Community and Labour disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation onto the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.28. **No. 115 Metal Machinist (Intermediate certificate (NQF 3)**
    (a)   Business supported inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
    (b)   Community and Labour disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.29. **No.116 Industrial Machinery Mechanic (Intermediate certificate (NQF 3)**
    (a)   Business supported inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
    (b)   Community and Labour disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.30. **No. 118 – Millwright (National Certificate (NQF 4)**

    (a)   Business and Labour supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL
    (b)   Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.

6.1.31. **No. 119 - Mechatronics Technician (Intermediate certificate (NQF 3)**
    (a)   Business and Labour supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
    (b)   Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.32. **No. 120 - Lift Mechanic (Intermediate certificate (NQF 3)**
    (a)   Business and Labour supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
    (b)   Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation onto the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.33. **No 121 Electrical Equipment Mechanic (Intermediate certificate (NQF 3)**
    (a)   Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
    (b)   Community and Labour disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.34. **No.122 Transportation Electrician (National Certificate (NQF 4)**
    (a)   Business supported inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.

(b)   Community and Labour disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation onto the list and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.35. **No. 123 Fashion Designer (Bachelor's Degree or Advanced Diploma (NQF Level 7)**

(a)   Business supported inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b)   Labour and Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation into the list.
(c)   It was agreed that Government would report on its final position on the inclusion of this occupation based on the recommendation from DHET as follows:
•   The occupation was not included in the original list because it failed D1 which relates to acute shortage and D2 which relates to strategic priority
•   However, the SETA survey had revealed that there was indeed a shortage – this is, however was not strong evidence by itself.
•   The Department of Home Affairs to decide – as evidence of shortage is not clear enough.

6.1.36. **No.124 Robotics and Production Automation (Honours Degree, Postgraduate Diploma, or Bachelor's Degree (NQF Level 8)**
(a)   Business and Labour supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b)   Community disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation to the CSL and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.37. **No. 126 Brand Manager Bachelor (Honours Degree, Postgraduate Diploma, or Bachelor's Degree (NQF Level 8)**
(a)   Business supported the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b)   Community and Labour disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation to the CSL and stated that South Africa had a surplus of workers with such qualifications.

6.1.38. **Fabric Technologist/Technician - 216301 for Fashion Designer**
(a)   This occupation was proposed by Business, and Community agreed with its inclusion into the CSL.
(b)   Government stated that it had passed the criteria to be included on the list, however, Labour did not agree with its inclusion and stated that this occupation could be filled in with local skills.

6.1.39. **Media Specialists**
(a)   Business proposed the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL, and Community agreed.
(b)   However, Labour did not agree with its inclusion and stated that this occupation could be filled in with local skills, as there were journalists who have been retrenched at local media houses who have such qualities and are now unemployed.

6.1.40. **Brand and Category Marketing Manager**

(a) Business had requested for the inclusion of Brand Manager into the CSL which is a specialisation of Marketing Practitioner. However, this was opposed by Labour and Community.

(b) The DHET recommended that this occupation had passed the criteria to be included on the List.

(c) However, Labour stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals with such qualifications.

(d) Government stated that the occupation was quite broad and it could require varying skills and qualifications depending on the context in which they are required. This would likely to create administrative difficulties in the granting of visas. It would therefore make a final decision in this regard.

6.1.41. **Garment Technologist - 216301 for Fashion Designer**
(a) Business proposed the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals with such qualifications, and therefore disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation onto the list.

6.1.42. **Chief Operating Officer (COO)**
(a) Business proposed the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals with such qualifications.
(c) Government recommended that this should be included in the CSL or as Specialisation.

6.1.43. **Digital Media Strategist/Analyst**
(a) Business proposed the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals with such qualifications and therefore disagreed with the inclusion of this occupation onto the list.
(c) Government recommended that this should be included in the CSL or as Specialisation.

6.1.44. **Automation Specialist**
(a) Business proposed the inclusion of this occupation into the CSL.
(b) Labour and Community stated that South Africa had a surplus of professionals with such qualifications.
(c) Government recommended that this should be included as it passed D1 criteria, which relates to acute shortage, based on survey; and D3-D6 which related to workers who are highly qualified/skilled and have a long lead-time to develop a supply pipeline.

6.2. Business supported the following occupations to be included on the List, however Community and Labour disagreed they proposed that a retention strategy was needed as South Africa was losing most of its nurses to Western countries:

6.2.1. **No. 63 Registered Nurse (Child and Family Health) (Honour Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

6.2.2. **No. 64 Registered Nurse (Community Health) (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

6.2.3. **No. 65 Registered Nurse (Medical) (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

6.2.4. **No. 66 Registered Nurse (Medical Practice) (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

6.2.5. **No. 67 Registered Nurse (Mental Health) (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma (NQF 8)**

6.2.6. **No. 68 Nurse Educator (Honours Degree or Postgraduate Diploma NQF 8)**

6.3. The following occupations were proposed by Business to be included in the CSL. However, Labour, Community and Government disagreed with the proposed inclusion and indicated that South Africa had adequate supply of skills to fill these occupations.

6.3.1. Maintenance Engineer
6.3.2. Chief Technology Officer (CTO)
6.3.3. Data Analyst
6.3.4. Oracle Cloud Consultant
6.3.5. Java Developer
6.3.6. Other ICT
6.3.7. IT Program Managers
6.3.8. Specialists Information Technology Management
6.3.9. Telecommunication Network Engineer
6.3.10. IT Application Development
6.3.11. Software Engineer
6.3.12. Sybase Database Specialist
6.3.13. Network Expert
6.3.14. SAP-BODS Developer
6.3.15. Systems Architect **OFO Code 251101**
6.3.16. Artificial Intelligence Specialist (AI)

6.4. The following list of occupations were proposed by Business; however, Government rejected their inclusion into the CSL as they failed to meet the set criteria to be included in the list:

6.4.1. Food Safety Auditors – **OFO Code 226304** for Food Inspector
6.4.2. Commercial Finance Manager **OFO Code 241204**
6.4.3. Visual Merchandiser – **OFO Code 343203**
6.4.4. Chief Financial Officer (CFO) /Financial Director (FD)
6.4.5. Creative Designers
6.4.6. Sales and Marketing Professionals
6.4.7. Direct Sales Professionals
6.4.8. Electrician
6.4.9. Fitter and Turner
6.4.10. Meat Technician – **OFO Code 681102** for red meat deboner

7. AREAS FOR FURTHER CONSIDERATION

7.1. The task team made the following recommendations to be considered further.

7.1.1. In its process of implementing the final CSL, Government should:

(a) Develop a skills development plan that would be constantly monitored. This process would assist Government to ensure that there was effective planning to incorporate the skills needed in different sectors in the country. Social partners emphasised the skills development plan as a key element for skills development in the country.

(b) Consider skills retention and skills transfer when implementing the final Critical Skills List, as that would assist in developing South African labour market.

(c) Table the Labour Migration Policy, which also provides for matters concerning skills transfer at Nedlac for engagement by social partners once all the Government internal processes have been concluded.

7.1.2. It was agreed that the process of skills importation should not hamper transformation agenda that was being undertaken in the labour market sector.

7.1.3. Research programmes such as LMI which conducts labour-market related research, should be used to provide an evidence-based approach to skills needed by the country. That approach should consider all negative variables that have affected the economy and the recovery necessary.

7.1.4. The Constituencies noted that the Critical Skills List was a short-term measure, however, it was agreed that the Critical Skills List will be reviewed on regular basis, possibly every two years, as the review process will provide perspective on the country's progress in relation to skills retention and skills transfer.

8. CONCLUSION

8.1. This report, therefore, concludes considerations of the Critical Skills Lists at Nedlac. The Report will be submitted to the relevant Ministers in terms of Section 8 of the Nedlac Act. No 35 of 1994 and the Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee on Home Affairs.

8.2. Constituencies are permitted to further promote their views on this matter through any channels they deem appropriate.

LIST OF TASK TEAM MEMBERS

BUSINESS:	LABOUR	GOVERNMENT	COMMUNITY	SECRETARIAT
B. Jack	B. Nhlapo	P. Mbhele	T. Josopu	N. Sibisi
T. Boshoff	M. Parks	M. Capazario	L. Kganyago	B. Milisi-Mngese
S. Jantjies	L. Mulaisi	M. Mampho	T. Monyahi	P. Mashabane
T. Muavha	G. Selematsela	W. Barnard	B. Gwija	B. Skhosana
Z. Ntyikwe	S. Ndhlovu	E. Tloane	H. Tsebe	
K. Qwabe	G. Masondo	F. Venter	R. Ntside	
M. Jacobs	A. Diale	H. Narsee	D. Mango	
P. Ramagaga	B. Molete	K. Mamphokhu		
T. Machaba		L. Madhlophe		
		M. Bobani		